| 116TH CONGRESS<br>1ST SESSION | S. |
|-------------------------------|----|
|-------------------------------|----|

To amend title 5, United States Code, to improve the effectiveness of major rules in accomplishing their regulatory objectives by promoting retrospective review, and for other purposes.

## IN THE SENATE OF THE UNITED STATES

Ms. Sinema (for herself and Mr. Lankford) introduced the following bill; which was read twice and referred to the Committee on

## A BILL

- To amend title 5, United States Code, to improve the effectiveness of major rules in accomplishing their regulatory objectives by promoting retrospective review, and for other purposes.
  - 1 Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-
  - 2 tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,
  - 3 SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE.
  - 4 This Act may be cited as the "Setting Manageable
  - 5 Analysis Requirements in Text Act of 2019" or the
  - 6 "SMART Act of 2019".

| 1  | SEC. 2. INCORPORATING RETROSPECTIVE REVIEW INTO          |
|----|--|
| 2  | NEW MAJOR RULES.   |
| 3  | (a) In General.—Subchapter II of chapter 5 of title      |
| 4  | 5, United States Code, is amended—                       |
| 5  | (1) in section 551—                                      |
| 6  | (A) in paragraph (13), by striking "; and"               |
| 7  | and inserting a semicolon;                               |
| 8  | (B) in paragraph (14), by striking the pe-               |
| 9  | riod at the end and inserting a semicolon; and           |
| 10 | (C) by adding at the end the following:                  |
| 11 | "(15) 'Administrator' means the Administrator            |
| 12 | of the Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs      |
| 13 | of the Office of Management and Budget established       |
| 14 | under section 3503 of title 44 and any successor to      |
| 15 | that office; and   |
| 16 | "(16) 'major rule' means any rule that the Ad-           |
| 17 | ministrator finds has resulted in or is likely to result |
| 18 | in—  |
| 19 | "(A) an annual effect on the economy of                  |
| 20 | \$100,000,000 or more;                                   |
| 21 | "(B) a major increase in costs or prices for             |
| 22 | consumers, individual industries, Federal,               |
| 23 | State, or local government agencies, or geo-             |
| 24 | graphic regions; or                                      |
| 25 | "(C) significant effects on competition, em-             |
| 26 | ployment, investment, productivity, innovation,          |

| 1  | health, safety, the environment, or on the abil-  |
|----|---|
| 2  | ity of United States-based enterprises to com-    |
| 3  | pete with foreign-based enterprises in domestic   |
| 4  | and export markets."; and                         |
| 5  | (2) in section 553, by adding at the end the fol- |
| 6  | lowing:   |
| 7  | "(f) Major Rule Frameworks.—                      |
| 8  | "(1) In General.—Beginning 180 days after         |
| 9  | the date of enactment of this subsection, when an |
| 10 | agency publishes in the Federal Register—         |
| 11 | "(A) a proposed major rule, the agency            |
| 12 | shall include a potential framework for assess-   |
| 13 | ing the major rule, which shall include a gen-    |
| 14 | eral statement of how the agency intends to       |
| 15 | measure the effectiveness of the major rule; or   |
| 16 | "(B) a final major rule, the agency shall         |
| 17 | include a framework for assessing the major       |
| 18 | rule under paragraph (2), which shall include—    |
| 19 | "(i) a statement of the regulatory ob-            |
| 20 | jectives of the major rule, including a sum-      |
| 21 | mary of the societal benefit and cost of the      |
| 22 | major rule;                                       |
| 23 | "(ii) the methodology by which the                |
| 24 | agency plans to analyze the major rule, in-       |
|    |   |

| 1  | cluding metrics by which the agency can      |
|----|--|
| 2  | measure—                                     |
| 3  | "(I) the effectiveness and bene-             |
| 4  | fits of the major rule in producing the      |
| 5  | regulatory objectives of the major           |
| 6  | rule; and                                    |
| 7  | "(II) the effects and costs of the           |
| 8  | major rule on regulated and other af-        |
| 9  | fected entities;                             |
| 10 | "(iii) a plan for gathering data re-         |
| 11 | garding the metrics described in clause (ii) |
| 12 | on an ongoing basis, or at periodic times,   |
| 13 | including a method by which the agency       |
| 14 | will invite the public to participate in the |
| 15 | review process and seek input from other     |
| 16 | agencies; and                                |
| 17 | "(iv) a specific time frame, as appro-       |
| 18 | priate to the major rule and not more than   |
| 19 | 10 years after the effective date of the     |
| 20 | major rule, under which the agency shall     |
| 21 | conduct the assessment of the major rule     |
| 22 | in accordance with paragraph (2)(A).         |
| 23 | "(2) Assessment.—                            |
| 24 | "(A) IN GENERAL.—Each agency shall as-       |
| 25 | sess the data gathered under paragraph       |

| 1  | (1)(B)(iii), using the methodology set forth in |
|----|---|
| 2  | paragraph (1)(B)(ii) or any other appropriate   |
| 3  | methodology developed after the issuance of a   |
| 4  | final major rule to determine whether the regu- |
| 5  | latory objective is being achieved—             |
| 6  | "(i) to analyze how the actual benefits         |
| 7  | and costs of the major rule may have var-       |
| 8  | ied from those anticipated at the time the      |
| 9  | major rule was issued; and                      |
| 10 | "(ii) to determine whether—                     |
| 11 | "(I) the major rule is accom-                   |
| 12 | plishing the regulatory objective;              |
| 13 | "(II) the major rule has been                   |
| 14 | rendered unnecessary, taking into               |
| 15 | consideration—                                  |
| 16 | "(aa) changes in the subject                    |
| 17 | area affected by the major rule;                |
| 18 | and   |
| 19 | "(bb) whether the major                         |
| 20 | rule overlaps, duplicates, or con-              |
| 21 | flicts with other rules or, to the              |
| 22 | extent feasible, State and local                |
| 23 | government regulations;                         |
|    |   |

| 1  | "(III) the major rule needs to be                |
|----|--|
| 2  | improved in order to accomplish the              |
| 3  | regulatory objective; and                        |
| 4  | "(IV) other alternatives to the                  |
| 5  | major rule or a modification of the              |
| 6  | major rule could better achieve the              |
| 7  | regulatory objective while imposing a            |
| 8  | smaller burden on society or increase            |
| 9  | net benefits, taking into consideration          |
| 10 | any cost already incurred.                       |
| 11 | "(B) Different methodology.—If an                |
| 12 | agency uses a methodology other than the         |
| 13 | methodology set forth in paragraph (1)(B)(ii)    |
| 14 | to assess data under subparagraph (A), the       |
| 15 | agency shall include as part of the notice re-   |
| 16 | quired under subparagraph (D) an explanation     |
| 17 | of the changes in circumstances that militated   |
| 18 | the use of that other methodology.               |
| 19 | "(C) Subsequent assessments.—If,                 |
| 20 | after an assessment of a major rule under sub-   |
| 21 | paragraph (A), an agency determines that the     |
| 22 | major rule will remain in effect with or without |
| 23 | modification, the agency shall—                  |
| 24 | "(i) in consultation with the Adminis-           |
| 25 | trator, include with the assessment pro-         |
|    |  |

| I  | duced under subparagraph (A) a list of cir-      |
|----|--|
| 2  | cumstances or events that would neces-           |
| 3  | sitate a subsequent review in accordance         |
| 4  | with subparagraph (A) to ensure that the         |
| 5  | major rule continues to meet the regu-           |
| 6  | latory objective; and                            |
| 7  | "(ii) develop a mechanism for the                |
| 8  | public to petition for a subsequent review       |
| 9  | of the major rule, which the head of the         |
| 10 | agency shall grant or deny.                      |
| 11 | "(D) Publication.—Not later than 180             |
| 12 | days after the date on which an agency com-      |
| 13 | pletes an assessment of a major rule under sub-  |
| 14 | paragraph (A), the agency shall publish a notice |
| 15 | of availability of the results of the assessment |
| 16 | in the Federal Register, including the specific  |
| 17 | circumstances or events that would necessitate   |
| 18 | a subsequent assessment of the major rule        |
| 19 | under subparagraph (C)(i).                       |
| 20 | "(3) AGENCY HEAD RESPONSIBILITIES.—The           |
| 21 | head of each agency shall—                       |
| 22 | "(A) oversee the timely compliance of the        |
| 23 | agency with this subsection; and                 |

| 1  | "(B) ensure that the results of each as-         |
|----|--|
| 2  | sessment conducted under paragraph $(2)(A)$      |
| 3  | are—   |
| 4  | "(i) published promptly on a central-            |
| 5  | ized Federal website; and                        |
| 6  | "(ii) noticed in the Federal Register            |
| 7  | in accordance with paragraph (2)(D).             |
| 8  | "(4) OMB OVERSIGHT.—The Administrator            |
| 9  | shall—   |
| 10 | "(A) issue guidance for agencies regarding       |
| 11 | the development of the framework under para-     |
| 12 | graph (1) and the conduct of the assessments     |
| 13 | under paragraph $(2)(A)$ ;                       |
| 14 | "(B) encourage and assist agencies to            |
| 15 | streamline and coordinate the assessment of      |
| 16 | major rules with similar or related regulatory   |
| 17 | objectives;                                      |
| 18 | "(C) exempt an agency from including the         |
| 19 | framework required under paragraph (1)(B)        |
| 20 | when publishing a final major rule, if the agen- |
| 21 | cy did not issue a notice of proposed rule mak-  |
| 22 | ing for the major rule in order to provide a     |
| 23 | timely response to an emergency or comply with   |
| 24 | a statutorily imposed deadline, in accordance    |
| 25 | with paragraph (6)(B); and                       |

| 1  | "(D) extend the deadline specified by an         |
|----|--|
| 2  | agency for an assessment of a major rule under   |
| 3  | paragraph (1)(B)(iv) or paragraph (2)(C)(i) for  |
| 4  | a period of not more than 90 days if the agency  |
| 5  | justifies why the agency is unable to complete   |
| 6  | the assessment by that deadline.                 |
| 7  | "(5) Rule of Construction.—Nothing in            |
| 8  | this subsection may be construed to affect—      |
| 9  | "(A) the authority of an agency to assess        |
| 10 | or modify a major rule of the agency earlier     |
| 11 | than the end of the time frame specified for the |
| 12 | major rule under paragraph (1)(B)(iv); or        |
| 13 | "(B) any other provision of law that re-         |
| 14 | quires an agency to conduct retrospective re-    |
| 15 | views of rules issued by the agency.             |
| 16 | "(6) Applicability.—                             |
| 17 | "(A) In general.—This subsection shall           |
| 18 | not apply to—                                    |
| 19 | "(i) a major rule of an agency—                  |
| 20 | "(I) that the Administrator re-                  |
| 21 | viewed before the date of enactment of           |
| 22 | this subsection;                                 |
| 23 | "(II) for which the agency is re-                |
| 24 | quired to conduct a retrospective re-            |
| 25 | view under—                                      |
|    |  |

| 1  | "(aa) section 2222 of the               |
|----|---|
| 2  | Economic Growth and Regu-               |
| 3  | latory Paperwork Reduction Act          |
| 4  | of 1996 (12 U.S.C. 3311);               |
| 5  | "(bb) section 170(d) of the             |
| 6  | Financial Stability Act of 2010         |
| 7  | (12  U.S.C.  5370(d));  or              |
| 8  | "(ce) any other provision of            |
| 9  | law with requirements that the          |
| 10 | Administrator determines—               |
| 11 | "(AA) include robust                    |
| 12 | public participation;                   |
| 13 | "(BB) include signifi-                  |
| 14 | cant agency consideration               |
| 15 | and analysis of whether the             |
| 16 | rule is achieving the regu-             |
| 17 | latory objective of the rule;           |
| 18 | and                                     |
| 19 | "(CC) meet, are sub-                    |
| 20 | stantially similar to, or ex-           |
| 21 | ceed the requirements of                |
| 22 | this subsection;                        |
| 23 | "(III) for which the authorizing        |
| 24 | statute of the rule is subject to peri- |
| 25 | odic authorization by Congress not      |

| 1  | less frequently than once every 10              |
|----|---|
| 2  | years; or                                       |
| 3  | "(IV) for which the authorizing                 |
| 4  | statute of the rule requires the pro-           |
| 5  | mulgation of a new or revised rule not          |
| 6  | less frequently than once every 10              |
| 7  | years; or                                       |
| 8  | "(ii) interpretative rules, general             |
| 9  | statements of policy, or rules of agency or-    |
| 10 | ganization, procedure, or practice.             |
| 11 | "(B) DIRECT AND INTERIM FINAL MAJOR             |
| 12 | RULE.—In the case of a major rule for which     |
| 13 | the agency is not required to issue a notice of |
| 14 | proposed rule making in response to an emer-    |
| 15 | gency or a statutorily imposed deadline, the    |
| 16 | agency shall publish the framework required     |
| 17 | under paragraph (1)(B) in the Federal Register  |
| 18 | not later than 6 months after the date on which |
| 19 | the agency publishes the final major rule.      |
| 20 | "(7) Judicial review.—                          |
| 21 | "(A) In general.—Judicial review of             |
| 22 | agency compliance with this subsection is lim-  |
| 23 | ited to—  |

| 1  | "(1) whether an agency published the                  |
|----|---|
| 2  | framework for assessment of a major rule              |
| 3  | in accordance with paragraph (1); or                  |
| 4  | "(ii) whether an agency completed                     |
| 5  | and published the required assessment or              |
| 6  | subsequent assessment of a major rule in              |
| 7  | accordance with subparagraphs (A), (C)                |
| 8  | and (D) of paragraph (2).                             |
| 9  | "(B) Remedy available.—In granting                    |
| 10 | relief in an action brought under subparagraph        |
| 11 | (A), the court may only issue an order remand-        |
| 12 | ing the major rule to the agency to comply with       |
| 13 | paragraph (1) or subparagraph (A), (C), or (D)        |
| 14 | of paragraph (2), as applicable.                      |
| 15 | "(C) Effective date of major rule.—                   |
| 16 | If, in an action brought under subparagraph           |
| 17 | (A)(i), a court determines that the agency did        |
| 18 | not comply, the major rule shall take effect not      |
| 19 | withstanding any order issued by the court.           |
| 20 | "(D) Administrator.—Any determina-                    |
| 21 | tion, action, or inaction of the Administrator        |
| 22 | shall not be subject to judicial review.".            |
| 23 | (b) Authorization of Appropriations.—There            |
| 24 | are authorized to be appropriated such sums as may be |

13

1 necessary to carry out the amendments made by sub-

2 section (a).